

# The Evolutionary Biology of the Threespine Stickleback

---

Edited by

MICHAEL A. BELL

*Department of Ecology and Evolution  
State University of New York at Stony Brook  
Stony Brook, New York, USA*

and

SUSAN A. FOSTER

*Department of Biological Sciences  
University of Arkansas  
Fayetteville, Arkansas, USA*

Oxford New York Tokyo

OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS

1994

*Oxford University Press, Walton Street, Oxford OX2 6DP*

*Oxford New York Toronto  
Delhi Bombay Calcutta Madras Karachi  
Kuala Lumpur Singapore Hong Kong Tokyo  
Nairobi Dar es Salaam Cape Town  
Melbourne Auckland Madrid  
and associated companies in  
Berlin Ibadan*

*Oxford is a trade mark of Oxford University Press*

*Published in the United States  
by Oxford University Press Inc., New York*

© Oxford University Press, 1994

*All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of Oxford University Press. Within the UK, exceptions are allowed in respect of any fair dealing for the purpose of research or private study, or criticism or review, as permitted under the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act, 1988, or in the case of reprographic reproduction in accordance with the terms of licences issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency. Enquiries concerning reproduction outside those terms and in other countries should be sent to the Rights Department, Oxford University Press, at the address above.*

*This book is sold subject to the condition that it shall not, by way of trade or otherwise, be lent, re-sold, hired out, or otherwise circulated without the publisher's prior consent in any form of binding or cover other than that in which it is published and without a similar condition including this condition being imposed on the subsequent purchaser.*

*A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library*

*Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data  
The Evolutionary biology of the threespine stickleback / edited by  
Michael A. Bell, Susan A. Foster*

*Includes bibliographical references and indexes.*

*1. Threespine stickleback. 2. Threespine stickleback—  
Evolution. 3. Threespine stickleback—Ecology. I. Bell,  
Michael A. II. Foster, Susan Adlai.*

*QL638.G27E96 1993 597'.53—dc20 92-38415*

*ISBN 0 19 857728 1*

*Typeset by Colset Pte Ltd, Singapore  
Printed in Great Britain by  
St Edmundsbury Press, Bury St Edmunds*

## Preface

---

The threespine stickleback, *Gasterosteus aculeatus*, has been used to address diverse problems in evolutionary biology and other subdisciplines in biology. Its wide use in biology largely reflects its favourable biological properties: its wide distribution, ecological versatility, extreme phenotypic variation, small size, and adaptability to the laboratory. However, as information about its biology has accumulated, the value of its intrinsic properties has been complemented by the accumulated knowledge which has facilitated subsequent research. Progress in our understanding of evolutionary processes is strongly dependent upon appreciation of the influences of multiple simultaneous effects, and consequently this accumulation of knowledge is crucial for the stickleback's use in evolutionary biology.

The breadth and volume of research on the threespine stickleback has stimulated previous comprehensive works on this species complex. Wootton's (1976) excellent first book has been an indispensable introduction for students and a valuable general reference for those interested in stickleback biology. A stickleback bibliography by Coad (1981) and later books by Paepke (1983, in German) and another, more narrowly focused book by Wootton (1984) have further increased accessibility of information on stickleback biology. There is even a delightful (and largely accurate) children's book on the life cycle of the threespine stickleback (Lane 1981). The importance of the threespine stickleback for biological research as well as for an early introduction to natural history has become widely recognized.

It has already been eight years since the most recent review of stickleback biology was published. There have been major developments during this time, and continued progress in the use of the threespine stickleback for evolutionary studies requires a new synthesis of our knowledge. We believe that the explosive growth of knowledge on stickleback behaviour, ecology, physiology, and evolution would make it very difficult for a single author or even a small group of coauthors to undertake a book that would adequately treat the major areas of research on evolution of the threespine stickleback. However, we also did not believe that a disconnected collection of research papers on stickleback biology would meet this need.

Accordingly, we set out to develop a volume that would combine the consistency, integration, and coverage of a single-author book with the currency, depth of knowledge, and critical judgement that specialists could bring to their subjects. Most chapters review major research areas to which the chapter authors have contributed. Although many chapters include

unpublished data or information on the authors' research that will soon appear in the journal literature, most of the chapters take a broader perspective. The individual chapters of this book are the intellectual products of the chapter authors, but we have tried to assemble a cohesive set of topics that centre on evolutionary biology and include the major developments in threespine stickleback biology. Author and subject indexes at the back of the volume represent a further attempt to facilitate use of the volume as a general introduction to the evolutionary biology of the threespine stickleback. We have also tried to impose a reasonably uniform format, style, and terminology throughout the book, and to resolve factual inconsistencies or conflicts of interpretation between chapters by different authors. Indeed, we have taken the liberty to intrude deeply into the usual prerogatives of contributors to multiauthored books. We hope that this intrusion has resulted in a reasonable level of integration and consistency of presentation.

The diversity of information bearing on the evolutionary biology of the threespine stickleback would make it difficult even to render informed editorial judgement of the chapters in this book without the assistance of numerous reviewers. Therefore, we have exploited the generosity of many colleagues who agreed to write critiques of the chapters and to make suggestions for their improvement. We are most grateful for the help of these external reviewers, who were John A. Baker, Theo C.M. Bakker, George W. Barlow, Jeffrey L. Beacham, Mark Bevelhimer, Bertil Borg, Brian W. Coad, Richard G. Coss, John P. Ebersole, Harry W. Greene, Helga E. Guderley, Anne E. Houde, G.J. Kenagy, Manfred Milinski, Gary G. Mittelbach, Guillermo Ortí, Donald H. Owings, Mark S. Ridgway, William J. Rowland, David L. Soltz, David W. Stephens, Nikki C. Tousley, David B. Wake, Jeffrey A. Walker, George C. Williams, David Sloan Wilson, and three anonymous reviewers. The reviewers often contributed extensive comments, and we are indebted to them for the numerous improvements to the book that resulted from their advice. However, their advice was not always followed by authors, and they are not responsible for the content of chapters. We are also most grateful to Nikki C. Tousley and Simon C. Nemptov, who did most of the work of verifying, organizing, and integrating citations from individual chapters into a single list of references. Editorial work on this book was completed while M.A.B. was on sabbatical leave at St Francis Xavier University, and thanks are due to the University for supporting this work and to D. Max Blouw for his hospitality.

*Stony Brook*  
*Fayetteville*  
December 1993

M. A. B.  
S. A. F.

# Contents

---

List of contributors	xi
1 Introduction to the evolutionary biology of the threespine stickleback	1
<i>Michael A. Bell and Susan A. Foster</i>	
Geographical distribution	2
Ecological distribution	4
General characterization of the threespine stickleback	5
Major dimensions of phenotypic variation in threespine stickleback	8
Phylogeny of the threespine stickleback species complex	13
Other important attributes of <i>Gasterosteus aculeatus</i> for evolutionary studies	21
Research programmes using the threespine stickleback	21
Conclusions	26
2 Systematics and morphology of the Gasterosteiformes	28
<i>Patricia S. Bowne</i>	
Osteology of <i>Gasterosteus</i>	29
Variation among the Gasterosteiformes	36
Interrelationships of the Gasterosteiformes	45
Proposed relatives of the Gasterosteiformes	51
3 Allozyme variation in the <i>Gasterosteus aculeatus</i> complex	61
<i>Donald G. Buth and Thomas R. Haglund</i>	
Methods	64
Patterns of allozyme variation	69
Direction of future research	83
Summary	83
4 Physiological ecology and evolution of the threespine stickleback	85
<i>Helga E. Guderley</i>	
The effect of environmental salinity, temperature, and oxygenation on stickleback	85
Environmental and hormonal control of the reproductive cycle	100
Future directions for research on the physiological ecology of stickleback	111
5 Energy allocation in the threespine stickleback	114
<i>R. J. Wootton</i>	
Consumption	116
Maintenance	120

Growth	126
Reproduction	133
Discussion and Conclusions	140
<b>6 Life history variation in female threespine stickleback</b>	<b>144</b>
<i>John A. Baker</i>	
Methods	146
Life history traits	148
Discussion	172
<b>7 Ecology of the threespine stickleback on the breeding grounds</b>	<b>188</b>
<i>Frederick G. Whoriskey and Gerard J. FitzGerald</i>	
Measures of reproductive success	189
Duration and timing of the breeding season	190
Breeding habitat	191
Variation in male reproductive success	193
Female reproductive success	198
Ecology of eggs, fry, and juveniles	201
Conclusions	204
<b>8 Evolution of foraging behaviour in the threespine stickleback</b>	<b>207</b>
<i>Paul J. B. Hart and Andrew B. Gill</i>	
The foraging environment	208
The foraging apparatus	210
Foraging behaviour	213
Future directions and thoughts on foraging theory	236
<b>9 Predators and morphological evolution in threespine stickleback</b>	<b>240</b>
<i>Thomas E. Reimchen</i>	
Predator diversity over the geographical range of stickleback	240
Predator diversity within localities	242
Quantifying mortality and predation intensity	245
Evidence for predators as selection agents on stickleback	246
Predators and morphology in Queen Charlotte Island stickleback	248
Partitioning causes of mortality: Drizzle Lake	254
Conclusions	273
<b>10 Adaptive variation in antipredator behaviour in threespine stickleback</b>	<b>277</b>
<i>F.A. Huntingford, P.J. Wright, and J.F. Tierney</i>	
Antipredator behaviour of the threespine stickleback	278
Variation in antipredator behaviour	280
Variation in antipredator behaviour among United Kingdom populations	285
Conclusions	295

11 Proximate determinants of stickleback behaviour: an evolutionary perspective	297
<i>William J. Rowland</i>	
Aggression and territoriality	298
Nest-building behaviour	308
Courtship and mating behaviour	313
Parental behaviour	337
Conclusions	343
12 Evolution of aggressive behaviour in the threespine stickleback	345
<i>Theo C.M. Bakker</i>	
Stickleback aggression: a multifarious phenomenon	346
The measurement of aggressiveness: methods	349
Causes of variation in aggressiveness	351
Natural selection, sexual selection, and the evolution of aggressiveness	373
Conclusions	379
13 Evolution of the reproductive behaviour of threespine stickleback	381
<i>Susan A. Foster</i>	
The reproductive behaviour of the threespine stickleback	382
Intergeneric comparisons and phylogenetic analysis	383
Interpopulation comparisons	385
Conclusions	396
14 Speciation and the evolution of reproductive isolation in the sticklebacks ( <i>Gasterosteus</i> ) of south-western British Columbia	399
<i>J.D. McPhail</i>	
Anadromous and stream-resident stickleback	404
Lake-stream divergence	411
Intralacustrine divergence—the benthic-limnetic pairs	418
Discussion	426
15 Palaeobiology and evolution of threespine stickleback	438
<i>Michael A. Bell</i>	
Overview of the fossil record of the Gasterosteidae	440
The palaeoecological distribution of fossil <i>Gasterosteus</i> phenotypes	446
The palaeobiology of <i>Gasterosteus doryssus</i>	447
Conclusions	469
16 Evolutionary inference: the value of viewing evolution through stickleback-tinted glasses	472
<i>Susan A. Foster and Michael A. Bell</i>	
Adaptation and the evolution of freshwater populations	473

Patterns of evolutionary change	478
The evolution of correlated characters	482
Phenotypic integration	483
Closing thoughts	484
References	487
Author index	557
Subject index	562



## Contributors

---

**John A. Baker** Department of Biological Sciences, University of Arkansas, Fayetteville, Arkansas 72701, USA

**Theo C.M. Bakker** Universität Bern, Zoologisches Institut, Abteilung Verhaltensökologie, Wohlenstrasse 50a, CH-3032 Hinterkappelen, Switzerland

**Michael A. Bell** Department of Ecology and Evolution, State University of New York at Stony Brook, Stony Brook, New York 11794-5245, USA

**Patricia S. Bowne** Department of Zoology, University of Alberta, Edmonton, Alberta T6G 2E9, Canada (Present address: Biology Department, Alverno College, 3401 South 39th Street, Milwaukee, Wisconsin 53234-3922, USA)

**Donald G. Buth** Department of Biology, University of California, Los Angeles, California 90024-1606, USA

**Gerard J. FitzGerald** Département de biologie, Université Laval, Ste Foy, Québec G1K 7P4, Canada

**Susan A. Foster** Department of Biological Sciences, University of Arkansas, Fayetteville, Arkansas 72701, USA

**Andrew B. Gill** Department of Zoology, University of Leicester, University Road, Leicester LE1 7RH, UK

**Helga E. Guderley** Département de biologie, Université Laval, Ste Foy, Québec G1K 7P4, Canada

**Thomas R. Haglund** Department of Biology, University of California, Los Angeles, California 90024-1606, USA

**Paul J.B. Hart** Department of Zoology, University of Leicester, University Road, Leicester LE1 7RH, UK

**F. A. Huntingford** Department of Zoology, University of Glasgow, Glasgow G12 8QQ, UK

**J. D. McPhail** Ecology Group, Department of Zoology, University of British Columbia, 6270 University Boulevard, Vancouver, British Columbia V6T 1Z4, Canada

**Thomas E. Reimchen** Department of Biology, University of Victoria, P.O. Box 1700, Victoria, British Columbia V8W 2Y2, Canada

**William J. Rowland** Department of Biology, Indiana University, Bloomington, Indiana 47405, USA

**J. F. Tierney** Department of Zoology, University of Glasgow, Glasgow G12 8QQ, UK

**Frederick G. Whoriskey** Department of Renewable Resources, Macdonald

College of McGill University, 21,111 Lakeshore Road, Ste Anne de Bellevue, Quebec H9X 1CO, Canada

**R.J. Wootton** Department of Biological Sciences, University College of Wales, Aberystwyth, Dyfed SY23 3DA, Wales, UK

**P.J. Wright** Department of Zoology, University of Glasgow, Glasgow G12 8QQ, UK (Present address: SOAFD Marine Laboratory, P.O. Box 101, Aberdeen AB9 8DB, UK)

(1994) *The Evolutionary Biology of the Threespine Stickleback*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. This radiation possesses two features that make it especially valuable for the evolutionary study of behavior. The first is that living oceanic fish closely resemble those which gave rise to the recent freshwater radiation, making it possible to understand a trait's ancestral condition relative to the postglacial freshwater radiation.Â Certain aspects of the behavior of stickleback seem to be characteristic of oceanic populations and also appear in most freshwater populations.